

Comparative Politics

Second Edition

Comparative Politics: Rationality, Culture, and Structure is the completely revised second edition of the volume that guided thousands of scholars through the intellectual demands and gratifications of comparative political science. Retaining a focus on the field's research schools, it now pays parallel attention to the pragmatics of causal research. Mark Irving Lichbach begins with a review of discovery, explanation, and evidence, and Alan S. Zuckerman argues for explanations with social mechanisms. Ira Katznelson, writing on structuralist analyses, Margaret Levi on rational choice theory, and Marc Howard Ross on culturalist analyses, assess developments in the field's research schools. Subsequent chapters explore the relationship among the paradigms and current research: Joel S. Migdal examines the state; Mark Blyth adds culturalist themes to work on political economy; Etel Solingen locates the international context of comparative politics; Doug McAdam, Sidney Tarrow, and Charles Tilly address contentious politics; Robert Huckfeldt explores multilevel analyses; Christopher J. Anderson describes nested voters; Jonathan Rodden examines endogenous institutions; Isabela Mares studies welfare states, and Kanchan Chandra proposes a causal account of ethnic politics. The volume offers a rigorous and exciting assessment of the past decade of scholarship in comparative politics.

Mark Irving Lichbach is Professor and Chair of Government and Politics at the University of Maryland. A theorist interested in social choice and a comparativist interested in globalization, Lichbach explores the connections between collective action theories and political conflict as well as the connections between collective choice theories and democratic institutions. He is the author or editor of many books, including the award-winning *The Rebel's Dilemma*, and of numerous articles that have appeared in scholarly journals in political science, economics, and sociology.

Alan S. Zuckerman is Professor of Political Science at Brown University. His most recent books are *Partisan Families: The Social Logic of Bounded Partisanship in Germany and Britain* (with Josip Dasović and Jennifer Fitzgerald), the winner of the International Society of Political Psychology's award for the best book published in 2007, and *The Social Logic of Politics: Personal Networks as Contexts for Political Behavior* (2005). Zuckerman edits the book series on *The Social Logic of Politics* for Temple University Press. During the spring semester 2007, he was the Lady Davis Visiting Professor of Political Science at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem.



Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics

General Editor

Margaret Levi University of Washington, Seattle

Assistant General Editor

Stephen Hanson University of Washington, Seattle

Associate Editors

Robert H. Bates Harvard University

Torben Iversen Harvard University

Stathis Kalyvas Yale University

Peter Lange Duke University

Helen Milner Princeton University

Frances Rosenbluth Yale University

Susan Stokes *Yale University*

Sidney Tarrow Cornell University

Kathleen Thelen Northwestern University

Erik Wibbels Duke University

Other Books in the Series

David Austen-Smith et al., eds., Selected Works of Michael Wallerstein: The Political Economy of Inequality, Unions, and Social Democracy

Lisa Baldez, Why Women Protest: Women's Movements in Chile

Stefano Bartolini, The Political Mobilization of the European Left, 1860–1980: The Class Cleavage

Robert Bates, When Things Fell Apart: State Failure in Late-Century Africa

Mark Beissinger, Nationalist Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet State

Nancy Bermeo, ed., Unemployment in the New Europe

Carles Boix, Democracy and Redistribution

Carles Boix, Political Parties, Growth, and Equality: Conservative and Social Democratic Economic Strategies in the World Economy

Catherine Boone, Merchant Capital and the Roots of State Power in Senegal, 1930–1985

Continued after the Index



Comparative Politics

RATIONALITY, CULTURE, AND STRUCTURE

SECOND EDITION

Edited by

MARK IRVING LICHBACH

University of Maryland

ALAN S. ZUCKERMAN

Brown University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521712347

© Cambridge University Press 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Comparative politics: rationality, culture, and structure / edited by Mark Irving Lichbach,

Alan S. Zuckerman.

p. cm.cludes bibliograph

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-88515-7 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-71234-7 (pbk.)

Political science – Research – Congresses.
 Comparative government – Research – Congresses.
 Lichbach, Mark Irving, 1951–
 Zuckerman, Alan S., 1945–
 Title.

JA 86.C 52 2009 320.3-dc22 2008016517

ISBN 978-0-521-88515-7 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-71234-7 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLS for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work are correct at the time of first printing, but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.



For
Faye
and Ricki,
again and always



Contents

Contributors Preface and Acknowledgments		page xi xv
2	THINKING AND WORKING IN THE MIDST OF THINGS: DISCOVERY, EXPLANATION, AND EVIDENCE IN COMPARATIVE POLITICS Mark Irving Lichbach	18
3	ADVANCING EXPLANATION IN COMPARATIVE POLITICS: SOCIAL MECHANISMS, ENDOGENOUS PROCESSES, AND EMPIRICAL RIGOR Alan S. Zuckerman	72
4	STRONG THEORY, COMPLEX HISTORY: STRUCTURE AND CONFIGURATION IN COMPARATIVE POLITICS REVISITED Ira Katznelson	96
5	RECONSIDERATIONS OF RATIONAL CHOICE IN COMPARATIVE AND HISTORICAL ANALYSIS Margaret Levi	117
6	CULTURE IN COMPARATIVE POLITICAL ANALYSIS Marc Howard Ross	134
7	RESEARCHING THE STATE Joel S. Migdal	162
8	AN APPROACH TO COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OR A SUBFIELD WITHIN A SUBFIELD? POLITICAL	
	ECONOMY Mark Blyth	193
		ix



X		Contents
9	THE GLOBAL CONTEXT OF COMPARATIVE POLITICS Etel Solingen	220
10	COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES ON CONTENTIOUS POLITICS Doug McAdam, Sidney Tarrow, and Charles Tilly	260
11	CITIZENSHIP IN DEMOCRATIC POLITICS: DENSITY DEPENDENCE AND THE MICRO-MACRO DIVIDE Robert Huckfeldt	291
12	NESTED CITIZENS: MACROPOLITICS AND MICROBEHAVIOR IN COMPARATIVE POLITICS Christopher J. Anderson	3 1 4
13	BACK TO THE FUTURE: ENDOGENOUS INSTITUTIONS AND COMPARATIVE POLITICS Jonathan Rodden	333
14	THE COMPARATIVE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF THE WELFARE STATE Isabela Mares	358
15	MAKING CAUSAL CLAIMS ABOUT THE EFFECT OF "ETHNICITY" Kanchan Chandra	376
References		413
Author Index		481
Subject Index		494



Contributors

Christopher J. Anderson is Professor of Government and Director of the Institute for European Studies at Cornell University. His research examines the microfoundations of democracy and political economy in comparative perspective. His most recent book is *Losers' Consent: Elections and Democratic Legitimacy* (Oxford University Press, 2005; with André Blais, Shaun Bowler, Todd Donovan, and Ola Listhaug), and he recently coedited *Democracy*, *Inequality*, *and Representation: A Comparative Perspective* (Russell Sage Foundation, 2008; with Pablo Beramendi). His current research projects investigate the impact of welfare state policies on people's social and economic behavior.

Mark Blyth is an associate professor of political science at the Johns Hopkins University. His research interests lie in the fields of comparative and international political economy. He is the author of *Great Transformations: Economic Ideas and Institutional Change in the Twentieth Century* (Cambridge University Press, 2002). He is currently engaged in several projects: a book on party politics in advanced welfare states called "The New Political Economy of Party Politics," a volume on constructivist theory and political economy entitled "Constructing the Global Economy," and a volume that surveys IPE around the world entitled "IPE as a Global Conversation." His articles have appeared in the *American Political Science Review, Perspectives on Politics, Comparative Politics, World Politics*, and *West European Politics*.

Kanchan Chandra works on the causes and consequences of the politicization of ethnic identities. She is an associate professor in the Department of Politics at New York University.

Robert Huckfeldt is a Distinguished Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Davis. His interests lie in the areas of elections, public opinion, participation, social contexts, and political communication networks. He is the author or coauthor of several books, including *Politics in Context*; *Race and the Decline of Class in American Politics*; *Citizens, Politics, and Social*

хi



xii Contributors

Communication; and Political Disagreement, as well as a series of articles concerned with the relationships among groups and individuals in politics.

Ira Katznelson is Ruggles Professor of Political Science and History at Columbia University. His most recent books are *Liberal Beginnings: Making a Republic for the Moderns* (coauthored with Andreas Kalyvas, 2008), *When Affirmative Action Was White: An Untold History of Racial Inequality in Twentieth-Century America* (2005), and *Desolation and Enlightenment: Political Knowledge after Total War*, *Totalitarianism, and the Holocaust* (2003). He served as president of the American Political Science Association for 2005–2006.

Margaret Levi is Jere L. Bacharach Professor of International Studies in the Department of Political Science at the University of Washington. Her sole-authored books include Of Rule and Revenue and Consent, Dissent, and Patriotism. She is the coauthor of Analytic Narratives and Cooperation Without Trust. She is a former president of the American Political Science Association and the general editor of the Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics series and of the Annual Review of Political Science.

Mark Irving Lichbach is Professor and Chair of Government and Politics at the University of Maryland. He received a B.A. (1973) from Brooklyn College of the City University of New York, an M.A. (1975) from Brown University, and a Ph.D. (1978) in political science from Northwestern University. A theorist interested in social choice and a comparativist interested in globalization, Lichbach explores the connections between collective action theories and political conflict as well as the connections between collective choice theories and democratic institutions. He is the author or editor of many books, including the award-winning The Rebel's Dilemma, and of numerous articles that have appeared in scholarly journals in political science, economics, and sociology. His work has been supported by NSF and private foundations. Lichbach, who was Book Review Editor of the American Political Science Review (1994-2001) and editor of the University of Michigan's Series on Interests, Identities, and Institutions, also served as chair of the political science departments at the University of Colorado (1995-1998) and the University of California, Riverside (1908–2001).

Isabela Mares is Associate Professor of Political Science at Columbia University, where she teaches courses on comparative political economy and comparative social policy. Her first book, *The Politics of Social Risk: Business and Welfare State Development* (Cambridge University Press, 2003), won the Gregory Luebbert Award for best book in comparative politics awarded by the APSA and the Best First Book in European politics awarded by the Council for European Studies. Her recent book, *Taxation*, *Wage Bargaining*, *and Unemployment* (Cambridge University Press, 2006), examines the consequences of the growth of the fiscal burden of the welfare state on unions' wage



Contributors xiii

bargaining strategies and on employment outcomes in advanced industrialized societies. She is currently completing a new book examining the relationship between inequality and social spending in developing countries.

Doug McAdam is Professor of Sociology at Stanford University. He is the author or coauthor of eight books and more than 60 articles in the area of political sociology, with a special emphasis on the study of social movements and revolutions. His best known works include *Political Process and the Development of Black Insurgency*, 1930–1970; Freedom Summer; and Dynamics of Contention (with Sid Tarrow and Charles Tilly). He was elected to the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in 2003.

Joel S. Migdal is the Robert F. Philip Professor of International Studies in the University of Washington's Henry M. Jackson School of International Studies. He was the founding chair of the University of Washington's International Studies Program. Dr. Migdal was formerly associate professor of Government at Harvard University and senior lecturer at Tel-Aviv University. Among his books are *Peasants*, *Politics*, *and Revolution*; *Palestinian Society and Politics*; *Strong Societies and Weak States*; *State in Society*; *Through the Lens of Israel*; *The Palestinian People: A History* (with Baruch Kimmerling); and *Boundaries and Belonging*. In 1993, he received the University of Washington's Distinguished Teaching Award; in 1994, the Washington State Governor's Writers Award; in 2006, the Marsha L. Landolt Distinguished Graduate Mentor Award; and, in 2008, the Provost Distinguished Lectureship.

Jonathan Rodden is Associate Professor of Political Science at Stanford University. His work focuses on the political economy of institutions. He has written a series of papers on federalism, decentralization, and distributive politics. His most recent book, *Hamilton's Paradox: The Promise and Peril of Fiscal Federalism* (Cambridge University Press, 2006), won the 2007 Luebbert Prize in comparative politics. He is currently working on a series of papers and a book manuscript on economic and political geography, as well as a series of papers on issue voting.

Marc Howard Ross was educated at the University of Pennsylvania and Northwestern University and is William R. Kenan, Jr., Professor of Political Science at Bryn Mawr College, where he has taught since 1968. He has done research in Canada, East Africa, France, Northern Ireland, the Middle East, and most recently in Spain and South Africa. His current work has two major themes: (1) the role that cultural performance and memory play in the escalation and de-escalation of ethnic conflict and (2) social science theories of conflict and their implications for conflict management. He has written or edited eight books, including *Cultural Contestation in Ethnic Conflict* (Cambridge University Press, 2007), *Culture and Belonging: Symbolic Landscapes and Contested Identities in Divided Societies* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009), *The*



xiv Contributors

Culture of Conflict, and The Management of Conflict (Yale University Press, 1993), and more than 75 articles that have appeared in academic journals and books.

Etel Solingen is Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Irvine, and author of Nuclear Logics: Contrasting Paths in East Asia and the Middle East (Princeton University Press, 2007); Regional Orders at Century's Dawn: Global and Domestic Influences on Grand Strategy (Princeton University Press, 1998); and Industrial Policy, Technology, and International Bargaining (Stanford University Press, 1996). Her articles on the links between domestic and international politics have appeared in the American Political Science Review, International Organization, Comparative Politics, International Studies Quarterly, International Security, Journal of Theoretical Politics, Journal of Democracy, Journal of Peace Research, International Relations of Asia-Pacific, Asian Survey, Global Governance, and International History Review, among others.

Sidney Tarrow teaches government and sociology at Cornell University. His most recent books are *Power in Movement* (Cambridge University Press, 1998), *The New Transnational Activism* (Cambridge University Press, 2005), and (with Charles Tilly) *Contentious Politics* (Paradigm, 2006). He is currently interested in transnational activism on behalf of human rights.

Until his untimely death in April 2008, **Charles Tilly** was Joseph L. Buttenwieser Professor of Social Science at Columbia University. His latest books include *Democracy* (Cambridge University Press, 2007), *Explaining Social Processes* (2008), and the posthumous *Contentious Performances*, also published by Cambridge (2008).

Alan S. Zuckerman is Professor of Political Science at Brown University. His most recent books are *Partisan Families: The Social Logic of Bounded Partisanship in Germany and Britain* (with Josip Dasović and Jennifer Fitzgerald), the winner of the International Society of Political Psychology's award for the best book published in 2007, and *The Social Logic of Politics: Personal Networks as Contexts for Political Behavior* (2005). Zuckerman edits the book series on *The Social Logic of Politics* for Temple University Press. During the spring semester 2007, he was the Lady Davis Visiting Professor of Political Science at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem.



Preface and Acknowledgments

Who now reads Max Weber? Seventy years ago, Talcott Parsons began his magisterial study of social thought by asking Crane Brinton's question about Herbert Spencer. Parsons demonstrated that by the end of the first third of the twentieth century, Weber's, Durkheim's, Pareto's, and Marshall's scholarship had eclipsed Spencer's social science and of the four theorists, Weber deserved pride of place. Has knowledge of Weber's social science among the current generation of students and professors of comparative politics mimicked the earlier abandonment of Spencer's social analysis?

When the senior comparativists in this volume attended graduate school, they studied Max Weber. From him, they learned about theories of regime types and transformation, economic development, bureaucracies, rationality, religion and politics, philosophy of social science, the tension between formal government and democratic processes, and a deep critique of modernity and of Marxist theory, among a host of basic matters. Most important, they developed an appreciation for grand questions of politics encased in theory and method.

Today, graduate studies in comparative politics more closely resemble professional training than library reading. Highlighting methods, students are taught that the best work combines fieldwork, interviews, surveys, archival work, experiments, and statistics, as well as formal models. Explaining substantive puzzles with causal arguments buttressed by extensive methods occupies the field's center. Successful scholarship displays the best techniques of analysis.

Weber understood that there is no opposition between mastering methods and social, economic, and political analysis. Moreover, he taught that scholarship demands examination of important questions, offering theoretically informed causal stories as well as applying the most appropriate methods. And so, following Weber, we have organized this volume around the interaction between paradigms – approaches to ontology, theory, and methods – and the pragmatics of causal analysis.

In this second edition of our volume, our colleagues and we interpret the state of comparative politics today, more than a decade after the first volume. The field has changed, and so the essays analyzing it have changed too.

XV



xvi

Preface and Acknowledgments

Another reason to offer a second edition is to update the service provided to young scholars of comparative politics across the globe. The volume serves as a survey and analysis of the field, and apparently, cohorts of graduate students have read and benefited from the essays in the first edition. We want to thank them for being attentive readers and to thank their teachers who thought that the volume would benefit their students. We hope that the second edition plays the same helpful role in the lives of many other graduate students in political science.

One of the gifts of publishing is the opportunity to express public and formal appreciation to people who offer assistance. It is a pleasure to thank Lew Bateman, our editor at Cambridge University Press, a persistent and wise guide, and our colleague Margaret Levi, who also leads (as well as edits) the Press's series on comparative politics, in which the first and this edition of the book appear. It is an honor to be in such impressive company. Thanks too to the Rockefeller Foundation for sponsoring a meeting at the Bellagio Conference and Study Center in October 2006. Conversations and exchanges of views at their superlative site initiated the work of this second edition. In addition, we offer our gratitude to several authors of the chapters – Margaret Levi, Ira Katznelson, Marc Ross, and Sidney Tarrow – for wise counsel as the project has unfolded.